SAMPLE WORKSHOP / 01

Deciding where AI belongs in teaching

45 minutes | A case discussion about feedback

Read the proposal, make an initial decision and examine both examples. Discuss the strongest challenge with a partner, then retain or revise your decision with reasons.

The proposal

A Year 9 science department proposes using AI to draft one short feedback comment for each pupil's explanation of droplets outside a cold glass. The teacher would check and edit every comment. Pupils would revise their answers. The goal is to explain the source of the water and its change of state.

The proposed benefit is more time for reading revisions and speaking to pupils. Checking time and pupils' use of the comments have not been established.

Prepared observations: Both glasses were intact, sealed and initially dry outside. Droplets appeared outside the cold glass. The room-temperature glass remained dry.

Example A

Pupil: "The air has water in it. The cold glass makes drops stick to the outside."

Draft: "You identify the air as the source of the water. Explain what form the water was in before the droplets appeared and what cooling changed. Use the terms water vapour and liquid water."

Example B

Pupil: "The water inside gets through tiny gaps when the glass is cold. The drops outside are liquid."

Draft: "Good explanation. The water moves from inside the glass to the outside as it cools. To improve, use the scientific word condensation."

Science note

In this case, the droplets come from water vapour in the surrounding air. On a sufficiently cold surface, above freezing and below the air's dew point, water vapour condenses into liquid. The water changes state; it has not travelled through the intact glass.

Check: NOAA cold-glass investigation / USGS condensation explanation

Both pupil responses and feedback drafts are fictional, written for this activity. No pupil information needs to be uploaded. Two examples cannot establish a product's reliability.

Examine the decision

Name or code _____ Date _____

Initial decision Circle one: Use / Restrict / Pilot / Defer

Use accepts the proposed routine. Restrict changes what is permitted. Pilot tests a limited use. Defer names what is needed before proceeding.

My initial reason and one unanswered question

_____

_____

What do the examples show

Case	Useful or inaccurate wording and the teacher's next action
A	
B	

Who should do each part

Task	What AI could contribute and what the teacher retains
Identify the learning gap	
Draft and check feedback	
Read the revision and act	

My partner's strongest challenge and an assumption to examine

_____

_____

Record the final decision

Final decision Circle one: Use / Restrict / Pilot / Defer

Why I changed or retained my decision

The exact use I would permit and what the teacher would retain

Conditions for any trial

Question and limited scope Include examples or sessions

Who checks drafts and what would cause us to stop or revise

Owner and review date If deferring state what is needed first

How I would examine understanding

The task or question I would give the pupil after feedback

What I would look for and what I would do if the gap remained

Before finishing: Is your decision more specific? What remains uncertain? Which part of this activity needed more time or explanation?